論　文

Hope out of Nihilism: The Significance of Music and Silence in *A Passage to India*

DRYDEN Izumi

要　旨

二十世紀を代表するイギリスの小説家エドワード・モーガン・フォースター（通称 E. M. フォースター）は，同時代同国の作曲家ベンジャミン・ブリテンに「音楽作家」と呼ばれた。その理由は，フォースターが音楽愛好家であったことをはじめ，ベートヴェンの交響曲やワーグナーのオペラをはじめとした音楽作品から音楽的要素や音楽的構造を理解して小説において意図的に使用しているからである。生存中に出版された小説五作品のうち，最後の小説『インドへの道』においては，ベートーヴェンの交響曲第九番の形式を発展させてオペラ形式を取り入れようとしたと考えられる。小説ペンギン版の『インドへの道』の巻末に収録されているフォースター作品の評論担当の批評家ピーター・バラは，『インドへの道』の三部構造は交響曲の三楽章の構成に類似していると指摘している。一方で，ブリテンは，フォースターの小説の構成はオペラ的であると示唆している。小説『インドへの道』は，ベートーヴェンの交響曲第五番の構造を持つフォースターの4番目の小説『ハワーズ・エンド』とフォースターの晩年の作品であるオペラ『ビリー・バッド』の中間に位置する。本論では，交響曲とオペラの両方の構造を併せ持つと考えられる『インドへの道』に焦点を当て，単に音楽的音だけではなく，「多様な声」をも作品に取り入れようと試みたフォースターの小説技巧に注目し，この作品を音楽的視点から再考していきたい。

Keywords: E. M. Forster: イギリスの小説家 E. M. フォースター，*A Passage to India*: 小説『インドへの道』，Musical elements: 音楽的要素，Musical structures: 音楽的構造，Beethoven: ベートーヴェン，Symphony: 交響曲，Wagner: ワーグナー，opera: オペラ，echoes: 洞窟のこだま，silence: 沈黙・静寂

Introduction

The twentieth-century British composer, Benjamin Britten (Edward Benjamin Britten, 1913-1976), described the twentieth-century British novelist E. M. Forster (Edward Morgan Forster, 1879-1970) as "our most musical author" (Borrello 144). Forster certainly was a "musical author" who used musical elements and forms to structure his literary works, particularly the five novels published during his lifetime. Another twentieth-century British writer, Anthony Burgess (John Anthony Burgess Wilson, 1917-1993), who also used musical elements and forms in his works, judged Forster's fifth novel *A Passage to India* (1924) his "last and best" (*The Novel Now* 32). By contrast, Forster considered *A Passage to India* "a failure" (King 73). Forster's negative assessment of this novel remains puzzling, considering that many of his friends regarded it highly, including the British novelist Virginia Woolf who praised *A Passage to India* by observing: "Now Mr Forster knows exactly how to use the elements of his genius" (Childs 52).

I first considered musical matters in the works of Forster in my 2001 master's thesis, *E. M. Forster's Version of "The Unfinished Ninth Symphony": His Use of Effective Sounds and Suggestions in "A Passage to India*." Since then, I have continued to study *A Passage to India* as Forster's version of a theoretically "unfinished" Symphony No. 9 in D minor, op. 125 of Beethoven (Ludwig van Beethoven, 1770-1827). I have done so by considering Forster's "use of effective sounds and suggestions" in *A Passage to India* and in his other novels and works. However, in my 2005 doctoral dissertation *Queer Christian Forster: Enshrined Ironies in the Opera "Billy Budd*," and in subsequent research, I have examined Forster's stated desire to produce an opera. I have concluded that *A Passage to India* can be reconsidered as an "operatic novel" in light of the opera *Billy Budd* (1951, 1960), on which Forster collaborated with the composer Benjamin Britten and the co-librettist Eric Crozier. Far from being a "failure," *Billy Budd* successfully premièred twenty-seven years after the publication of *A Passage to India* and remains in the operatic repertoire to the present day.

I am not alone in my study of the musical aspects of Forster's literary art. The critic Judith Scherer Herz notes that Britten, "who more than anyone was able to recognize Forster's instinctive musicality" (*Queer Forster* 140), described Forster's way of writing in musical terms: Britten claimed that "the construction of Forster's novels often resembles that of the 'classical' opera" (140). Such a perspective implicitly endorses research into *A Passage to India* from an operatic point of view.

The current paper represents developments in my thinking about Forster as a "musical writer," extending the ideas of my master's thesis and my doctoral dissertation. I now wish to examine the evidence of the "operatic" elements *in A Passage to India* by comparing them to the opera *Billy Budd*. I intend to do so by focusing on Forster's technique of adapting musical elements and structures from the music of Beethoven and other composers in *A Passage to India* and other literary works.

1. Musical Elements in *A Passage to India*

Forster acquired a sense of musical structure, rhythm, and harmony in the course of learning to play the piano as a young man. He describes the ways he was taught such musical elements in his 1939 essay, "Not Listening to Music": "They teach me a little about construction. I see what becomes of a phrase, how it is transformed or returned, sometimes bottom upward, and get some notion of the relation of keys" (*Two Cheers for Democracy* 130). From such early influences, musical elements became important sources in Forster's writings and are essential to a proper understanding of what is going on in his novels.

In *A Passage to India*, many musical elements appear, often recurring from his other works. But the crucial difference from his four previous novels is that in *A Passage to India*, elements not only from European classical music but also from Indian music, i.e., drums and *raga*, appear. Both classical and Indian music are sometimes played together to break silence, suggestive of the ways in which the three peoples who are living adjacent to each other in India–Hindus, Muslims, and British–are dealing with each other. As Forster writes, "The English community contributed an amateur orchestra. Elsewhere some Hindus were drumming" (*Passage* 41). The man who listens to these two types of music is Dr. Aziz, a Muslim doctor in India, but paradoxically he is not interested in music at all.

Aziz tries to connect with three of the main British characters, Mrs Moore, Cyril Fielding, and Adela Quested, relatively liberal-minded people who try hard to make friends with Indian people and understand them, but Aziz's tragedy begins from that time. He talks too much to them about his "inner voice" arising from his chaotic feelings; he tries too hard to show his good face. Fatefully, such faux pas lead him to visit Malabar Caves, which he had originally not planned to do, but he is compelled to go there because the three British characters hold him to his promise. He frequently regrets his words after saying something to show his good face to them because afterwards he realizes that he cannot do what he has promised.

During the trip to the caves, the "echoes" within them create a most unfortunate incident that is contrary to Dr. Aziz's good intentions.

> It is entirely devoid of distinction. Whatever is said, the same monotonous noise replies, and quivers up and down the walls until it is absorbed into the roof. 'Boum' is the sounds as far as the human alphabet can express it, or 'bou-oum,' or 'ou-boum' – utterly dull. Hope, politeness, the blowing of a nose, the squeak of a boot, all produce 'boum.' . . . And if several people talk at once an overlapping howling noise begins, echoes generate echoes, and the cave is stuffed with a snake composed of small snakes, which writhe independently. (158-159; underlining mine)

Generally in Forster's novels, characters undergo positive transformations, so that readers can see the improvement of certain characters, especially the main ones; however, in *A Passage to India*, the characters at the end are not much different from the way they were in the beginning: no one really improves, and "all produce 'boum'." Why does this happen?

One reason to consider is that everyone in *A Passage to India* talks or makes noises without regarding each other very mindfully. Fifteen years after the novel was published, Forster stated that "tolerance, good temper and sympathy" were the virtues he considers "what matter really" in human affairs ("What I Believe," *Two Cheers* 67). In *A Passage to India*, however, while such virtues may try to rise to the surface, they nevertheless disappear into "boum." The story on the whole is filled with too many sounds which turn into "boum." This applies even to such non-human noises as "the sky"—which says at the end of the story, "No, not there" (316). What the sky says negatively suggests that both the inside and the outside of the cave remain the same, without any improvement by people in India, because "the sky settles everything–not only climates and seasons, but when the earth shall be beautiful" (32). All this suggests that the whole India itself is one of the caves–doing nothing but sounding "boum" all the time.

Forster employs Hindu music and songs, possibly to save his characters from such "boum" situations, but unfortunately his efforts do not succeed as expected. Or rather, as Forster used the song sung by the Hindu Professor Godbole to create sympathy with what the sky says, musical elements in the story do not lead to a harmonious and hopeful ending, in contrast to the endings of Forster's previous four novels in which such elements and structures of Western classical music appear. In *A Passage to India*, in contrast to the other four novels, no classical composers are mentioned; only some suggestions are recognized in the story if readers pay attention to musical elements: "Like the Ninth Symphony, in chapter

fifteen of *A Passage to India* there happens the terrifying surprise, and the tide of the story runs into 'minor' circumstances" (Okuyama 5).

As I continued to observe, "The story of the novel is told in three parts, 'I. Mosque,' 'II. Caves,' and 'III. Temple.' The tragedy, the climax of the novel, suddenly breaks out in Part II when Adela Quested, . . . discovers 'no love' exists towards her fiancé, Ronny Heaslop, a British official" (Okuyama 5). Heaslop's view of India is completely the opposite of his mother Mrs Moore's. Then, "Aziz, a Muslim Indian doctor, falls victim to their lack of love" (Okuyama 5). This scene may remind readers of the opera by Wagner (Wilhelm Richard Wagner, 1813-1883), *Tristan und Isolde* (1859, first performed in 1865). As at least one critic has observed, "Wagner himself was terrified by his own opera" (Boyden 275). Wagner wrote to Mathilde Wesendonck that "Tristan is turning into something fearful! . . . . I'm afraid the opera will be forbidden . . . . Completely good ones are bound to drive people mad" (Boyden 275). In *A Passage to India*, after the fearful experiences in the cave, "echoes," which sound "boum," effectively drive all the characters in the story mad.

2. Symphonic and Operatic Elements in *A Passage to India*

The critic Matthew Boyden states that "*Tristan und Isolde* is the most extreme opera ever written" (Boyden 275) and also explains that the "orchestral score of *Tristan* is full of unimaginably complex chromatic harmonies, thick with dissonances and unresolved suspensions" (Boyden 276; underlining mine). Similarly, *A Passage to India* may be described as "full of unimaginably complex chromatic harmonies with dissonances and unresolved suspensions." The novel was published fourteen years after Forster's fourth novel *Howards End*, and Forster seems to have tried to adapt a Beethoven symphony once again, as he had done successfully in *Howards End* with Symphony No. 5 in C minor, opus 67. In *A Passage to India*, Forster used Symphony No. 9 in D minor, opus 125, to structure the plot and lead to an ending with at least a little hope. As Peter Burra observes, "*The Longest Journey and A Passage to India*, with their three parts –'Cambridge, Swanston, Wiltshire'; 'Mosque, Caves, Temple'—are planned like symphonies in three movements" (Forster, *A Passage to India* 325). However, using a symphony to structure the novel was highly problematic and, in regard to *A Passage to India*, Forster felt that his attempt to do so "is a failure" (King 73), as noted earlier in the introduction of this paper.

In order to use Beethoven's Symphony No. 9 to structure the entire plot of *A Passage*

to India with symphonic elements, Forster needed to have an additional section, a "Part IV," to complete the symphonic form which typically contains four movements. As it stands, in *A Passage to India* the fourth part is missing, rendering the novel an "unfinished Ninth Symphony." In comparing the novel with Symphony No. 9, Part III in the novel can conceivably overlap with the symphony's fourth movement, though "only the joy of Hindu's festival is emphasized" (Okuyama 6):

> The fourth movement of the Symphony begins with strange noises, and the beginning of the Part III in the novel included all experiences and sounds, therefore evoking Beethoven's situation which tells that people have to struggle and surmount difficulties before reaching joy, which overlaps with the situations of characters in Part III of the novel. In the fourth movement of the Symphony, the beginning of the first, the second, the third movement appear over and again and the melody of the joy that is coming out. (Okuyama 6)

One of the reasons that "only the joy of Hindu's" appears in the end is that in *A Passage to India*, the Hindu characters including Professor Godbole do not fear the cave's "echoes," in contrast to the Western characters.

Another reason that Forster considered *A Passage to India* as "a failure" could be that expressing "Hindu music" or "boum" is not easily achieved through a symphony without voices. Success requires "voices" to tell exactly what is going on, and it has to be sung. Consequently, Forster seems to have recognized the limits of what symphonies can do to structure a novel successfully. I conclude that "the relationship between Aziz and Fielding ends up with a discord at the end of the story, for there is something to disturb, just like 'the goblins' in *Howards End*, with no understanding between them" (Okuyama 7). The sky says in *A Passage to India*, "No, not <u>there</u>" (*A Passage to India* 316; underlining mine), as if to suggest that the "goblins" and the "echoes," respectively, have not disappeared from "there" yet.

In *A Passage to India*, Professor Godbole explains the Hindu song, which is called *raga*, and he sings, "I say to Him [God], Come, come, come, come, come, come. He neglects to come" (96). Godbole's way of singing is described by the narrator: "At times <u>there seemed rhythm</u>, at times there was <u>the illusion of a Western melody</u>" (95; underlining mine). The sounds of the song suggest the novel's structure as the combination of a symphony in which there are "rhythms" and an opera filled with "melodies of illusion."

Forster considered Beethoven his favorite symphonic composer; regarding opera, Forster was "an ardent Wagnerian" (Croizer, "Writing of *Billy Budd*" 12). This and other

evidence suggest that Forster may have imagined producing grand Wagnerian operas. Critic Mike Edwards, for example, observes that Forster "was fond particularly of Beethoven and Wagner, and tried to bring to his novels something of the thematic complexity of those composers by weaving ideas into the texture of his writing in a manner he described in *Aspects of the Novel* in the phrase 'repetition plus variation'" (Edwards 11).

In considering Forster's use of Beethoven, the narrator in *Howards End* describes Beethoven's symphonic style in Symphony No. 5:

> Beethoven chose to make all right in the end. He built the ramparts up. He blew with his mouth for the second time, and again the goblins were scattered. He brought back the gusts of splendor, the heroism, the youth, the magnificence of life and of death, and, amid vast roarings of a superhuman joy, he led his Fifth Symphony to its conclusion. (47; underlining mine)

It may be that "Beethoven chose to make all right in the end," but Forster was not always successful in doing the same in his novels, especially in *A Passage to India*. After *Howards End*, Forster may have thought that he needed to use a symphony with voices, and of all Beethoven's nine symphonies, only the Ninth, the "Choral Symphony," includes vocal parts and a style in which men and women sing together as in an opera. Forster argued that "turning dullish stuff into great stuff is characteristic of Beethoven" (*Two Cheers* 126); unfortunately, the "dullish stuff" does not turn into "great stuff" in *A Passage to India*. If Beethoven's style does not easily adapt to the structure of that novel, it may nevertheless be considered from a different point of view. In an alternative method of analysis, one might regard the novel as "operatic," even though readers cannot hear the music itself in the book.

Georges Liebert, who considers "Music" as "a Metaphor of Life" (2), states in *Nietzsche and Music* that "To read is to listen, and to listen is already to think" (6). Liebert advises readers "to read" the last part of *A Passage to India* by regarding the Hindu festival scene as suggestive of Beethoven's Symphony No. 9, particularly in the way that Professor Godbole leads his choir with cymbals and drums: "He and six colleagues who supported him clashed their cymbals, hit small drums, droned upon a portable harmonium, and sang" (282). Then, "They loved all men, the whole universe, and scraps of their past, tiny splinters of detail, emerged for a moment to melt into the universal warmth" (283). In composing Symphony No. 9 and setting Schiller's idealistic poetry about universal brotherhood to music, Beethoven may have intended to encourage people "to love each other." Beethoven had found "joy" in God's existence. However, as Professor Godbole explained, "I say to

Him [God], Come, come, come, come, come, come. He neglects to come" (96), even in such a joyful time as the festival in the novel. Therefore, the fourth "choral" movement of Beethoven's Ninth is not realized in *A Passage to India*, suggesting rather somberly that the time is still not at hand for all people to find a way to love each other.

Shifting from Beethoven's symphonies to Wagner's operatic music dramas as ways of understanding *A Passage to India*, Britten notes that the "construction of [Forster's] novels often resembles opera" (Borrello 144). Audrey A. P. Lavin suggests that Forster's "connection of musical pattern with mystical plot continues to suggest to his readers that form exists on a much grander scale than can be discerned" (Lavin 101). In his own 1935 essay, "Word-Making and Sound-Taking," Forster says that "I feel bound to put words to a classical tune" (*Abinger* 103). Anthony Parr claims that Forster "borrowed many of his ideas about rhythm and structure in the novel from his knowledge of music, and his lifelong interest in Wagner led him to attempt a leitmotif technique in his own writing" (Parr 1). Moreover, Forster uses Wagnerian music quite openly to structure the plot and suggest the themes of his second novel, *The Longest Journey* (1907).

As for Wagnerian operatic elements in *A Passage to India*, Forster seems to have wanted to place Aziz and Fielding in a homosexual relationship, but he was not completely successful in doing so. Judith Scherer Herz notes: "For interest in Wagner at the turn of the century was not just evidence of an avant-garde aesthetic, it was also, for homosexuals, a lightly coded affirmation of sexual preference" (Martin & Piggford 141). Even in the opera *Billy Budd*, the homosexual relationship is not successfully completed, and such "incomplete" situations produce tragic elements in the novel and the opera. Friedrich Nietzsche (1844-1900) is famous for the claim in his first work, in 1872, *The Birth of Tragedy Out of the Spirit of Music:* "Without music, life would be an error" (Liebert 8). Nietzsche was highly affected by Wagner throughout his life and states in *The Case of Wagner* that "Wagner believed in the Revolution . . . His union . . . is 'the sacrament of free love; the rise of the golden age; the twilight of the gods for the old morality–all ill has been abolished'" (Liebert 144; underlining mine).

"Free love" and the situation in which "all ill has been abolished" are also what Beethoven, whom Wagner idolized, wished for. But "all ill has" certainly not "been abolished" in *A Passage to India*, even though Forster was searching for better forms of human relations. Unfortunately, most people are too busy thinking of themselves to think about others. Part III of *A Passage to India*, with its musical elements to describe the joyful

festival, reminds readers of what is possible in life. Otherwise, even with descriptions of sounds and noises in the novel, if readers do not listen to them, if they are left as silences, the novel's aim dissolves into sad meaninglessness.

3. Places of Silence in *A Passage to India*

Silence can be defined by context, and the meanings of "silence" must change in every situation depending on what it is compared with. There are many silent moments in *A Passage to India*, and visually "silence" can be recognized in the places in which Forster intentionally seemed to use the ellipsis ". . ." to express silent situations in contrast of sounds, noises, and talking. If my counting is right, there are forty-one examples of ". . ." in Part I, seventy-three in Part II, and fifteen in Part III, all together one hundred twenty-nine in total in the novel.

In Forster's four other novels, examples of the ellipsis ". . ." are relatively rare. Consequently, Forster may have used the device ". . ." deliberately in *A Passage to India*, and reflecting on why he did this so many times may reveal aspects of the structure of the novel from a different perspective. Although limitations of space do not permit me to list all of the examples of this device in *A Passage to India*, I offer, in what follows, selected examples (underlining mine).

Some uses of the device ". . ." seem to omit repetitions or avoid reiteration:

e.g. 1: "Why talk about the English? Brrr . . .!" (35)

e.g. 2: "Dinner, dinner, dinner . . ." (36)

e.g. 3: "There were owls, the Punjab mail . . ." (41)

Some seem to express a person's feeling:

e.g. 1: "Aziz, Aziz, imprudent boy . . ." (38)

e.g. 2: "Tell me where they have put her, oh, Mrs Moore . . ." (227)

e.g. 3: "Don't come near me . . ." (295)

Some seem to suggest what a person wants to continue to say:

e.g. 1: "Perhaps . . . but later . . ." (37)

e.g. 2: "I see . . ." (83)

e.g. 3: "Exactly . . ." (192)

Some seem to convey hesitation:

e.g. 1: "God . . . is. . . love" (70)

e.g. 2: “Though I speak with the tongues of . . .” (71)

e.g. 3: “I’m coming back . . .” (234)

Some seem to express silence:

e.g. 1: “Beyond which again. . . .” (60)

e.g. 2: “. . . Dear me, I’ve got a headache this evening.” (274)

e.g. 3: “The palanquin moved . . .” (301)

Moreover, considering the numerous “silent” parts in the novel, silences exist when sounds, noises, and conversations do not occur. The many ways in which Forster uses the ellipsis “. . .” in his works to express various kinds of silence certainly merit further study.

Understanding what Forster meant by “silence” may be critical to assessing both his art and his life. Forster’s concluding words in his last letter (dated 1969) to May Buckingham, a significant figure in his life, takes the meaning of “silence” deeper: “Darling/ Silence cannot mean peace” (Lago & Furbank 294; underlining mine). Forster may have wanted to say that through his novels and other works, the interplay of silence and sound, expressed through voice, was central to what he had to say about life. Significantly, *A Passage to India* does not end in “silence,” but with the “sky voice.” Indeed, “voice” was necessary for Forster in his novels–in dialogue, of course, but also as a way to express his themes. For such reasons, Forster may have used “voices” suggested by Beethoven’s Symphony No. 9 and Wagner’s operatic music dramas to provide depth and resonance in *A Passage to India*.

Conclusion

According to the Forster scholar Wilfred Stone, “To be sensitive to what is going on becomes, after 1924, virtually Forster’s vocation” (Stone 348). Forster worked fitfully on *A Passage to India* and wrote to the English poet Sassoon (Siegfried Sassoon, 1886-1967) that “I shall never write another novel.” Nevertheless, he also told Sassoon: “But I shall go on writing” (Beauman 334). As Forster promised, after *A Passage to India* he did not publish another novel during his lifetime. Instead, along with many collections of essays he wrote the libretto to the opera *Billy Budd* in collaboration with Benjamin Britten and Eric Crozier. In a letter of 1950 to Britten, Forster describes *Billy Budd* as his “most important piece of writing . . . [and] all delighted me. Most wonderful” (Lago & Furbank Vol. II 242; underlining mine). Forster remarked of working on the opera: “I felt quite differently to what I have felt while writing other things, . . . completely different” (Colmer 181). Forster’s

efforts to write an operatic novel in *A Passage to India* were replaced in time by "working on the libretto," which became the "most wonderful" work, the opera *Billy Budd*, realized as a "real opera" later in his life. In this way, Forster's dream of producing an opera came true in his later years.

In his essay "The Raison D'Etre of Criticism in the Arts" (1947), Forster stated that "Believing as I do that music is the deepest of the arts. . . I love music" (*Two Cheers* 107). There Forster explains the connections of the novel and music, showing the possibilities in which novelists might adapt music to literary ends:

> Music, though it does not employ human beings, though it is governed by intricate laws, nevertheless does offer in its final expression a type of beauty which fiction might achieve in its own way. Expansion. That is the idea the novelist must cling to. Not completion. Not rounding off but opening out. When the symphony is over we feel that the notes and tunes composing it have been liberated, they have found in the rhythm of the whole their individual freedom. Cannot the novel be like that? (*Aspects* 149-150)

Forster explains the importance of music further in his essay "What I Believe": "Music, more than any of the other arts, postulates a double existence. It exists in time, and also exists outside time, instantaneously. . . . I can conceive myself hearing a piece as it goes by and also when it has finished" (*Two Cheers* 120; underlining mine). What readers of *A Passage to India* must do is to follow up "hearing a piece" which "has finished" in the novel, by listening for it in a subsequent work of Forster, the opera *Billy Budd*. We can listen to the sequel of the novel in the opera. Britten observes in "Some Notes on Forster and Music": "I don't mean that [Forster] just likes music or likes going to concerts and operas, or plays the piano neatly and efficiently (all of which he does), but that he really understands music and uses music in his novels, and fairly frequently" (Stallybrass 81). In short, Forster's novels should not only be read, but should also be "listened to." Novalis (Friedrich von Hardenberg, 1772-1801) asserted that "One must write as one composes" (Liebert 4). In this spirit, Stone claims, Forster's "effort in *Aspects of the Novel* is to elevate the novel to Art" (Borrello 119).

Although in *A Passage to India* the "relationship between Aziz and Fielding ends up with a discord at the end of the story" (Okuyama 7), the opera *Billy Budd* brings cheer with the melodious choral song, "O heave! O heave away, heave! O heave!" (Herbert 183). The song may be considered as Forster's advice to readers and opera-goers to continue making

efforts to love each other, in a world that is problematic but not wholly fallen. As Forster says, “Evil. . . . I don’t believe evil exists” (*Aspects* 170). “Forster’s work on the opera *Billy Budd* was his personal song of prayer, his hymn for redemption” (Dryden xvi)

Further research into Forster’s uses of sound and silence might examine the unfinished novel *Arctic Summer* (1980), which Forster abandoned but which was nevertheless published posthumously. It would be worthwhile to explore Forster’s intentional use of “silence” in this novel and in his others, comparing the points of sounds, noises, conversations, and silences. *Arctic Summer* itself contains the word “silence” (10): “Not to be silent” is important for those who write. Clearly further research is needed into Forster’s preoccupations with sound and silence in human relations, in the novels in which his characters struggle with the author’s emblematic motto for *Howards End*: “Only connect . . ..”

Works Cited

Alder, Erik and Dietmar Hauck. *Music and Literature: Music in the Works of Anthony Burgess and E. M. Forster: An Interdisciplinary Study*. Tubingen: A. Francke Verlag, 2005. Print.

Beauman, Nicola. *Morgan: A Biography of E. M. Forster.* London: Sceptre, 1994. Print.

Borrello, Alfred. *E. M. Forster: An Annotated Bibliography of Secondary Materials*. Metuchen: Scarecrow, 1973. Print.

Boyden, Matthew. *The Rough Guide to Opera: The Essential Guide to the Operas, Composers, Artists and Recordings*. London: Rough Guides, 2002. Print.

Burgess, Anthony. *The Novel Now: A Student’s Guide to Contemporary Fiction*. London: Faber & Faber, 1971. Print.

Childs, Peter, ed. *A Routledge Literary Sourcebook on E. M. Forster’s A Passage to India*. London: Routledge, 2002. Print.

Colmer, John. *E. M. Forster the Personal Voice*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1975. Print.

Crozier, Eric. “The Writing of Billy Budd.” *The Opera Quarterly 4.3* (1986): 11-27. Print.

Dryden, Izumi Okuyama. *Queer Christian Forster: Enshrined Ironies in the Opera “Billy Budd.”* Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation. 2005. Print.

Edwards, Mike. *E. M. Forster The Novels*. Hampshire: Palgrave, 2002. Print.

Fillion, Michelle. *Difficult Rhythm: Music & The Word in E. M. Forster.* Champaign: U of Illinois P, 2010. Print.

Forster, Edward Morgan. *Abinger Harvest*. 1936. San Diego: Harcourt Brace, 1964. Print.

---. *A Passage to India*. 1924. Ed., Oliver Stallybrass. London: Penguin, 1989.

---. *Arctic Summer*. 1980. Ed., Anita Desai. London: Hesperus, 2003. Print.

---. *Aspects of the Novel.* 1927. London: Penguin, 1990. Print.

---. *Howards End*. 1910. London: Penguin, 1992. Print.

---. *The Longest Journey.* 1907. Ed., Elizabeth Heine. London: Penguin, 2001. Print.
---. *Two Cheers for Democracy*. 1951. San Diego: Harcourt Brace. 1979. Print.
---. Eric Crozier. *Billy Budd: Opera in Two Acts*. London: Boosey & Hawkes, 1961. Print.
Herbert, David, ed. *The Operas of Benjamin Britten.* Herbert, 1989. Print.
King, Francis. *E. M. Forster.* New York: Thames and Hudson, 1988. Print.
Lago, Mary, Linda K. Hughes, and Elizabeth Macleod Walls, eds. *The BBC Talks of E. M. Forster 1929-1960*. Columbia: U of Missouri P, 2008. Print.
Lago, Mary and P. N. Furbank, eds. *Selected Letters of E. M. Forster: Volume One, 1879-1920*. Cambridge: Harvard UP, 1983. Print.
---. *Selected Letters of E. M. Forster Volume Two 1920-1970*. Cambridge: Harvard UP, 1985. Print.
Lavin, Audrey A. P. *Aspects of the Novelist: E. M. Forster's Pattern & Rhythm*. New York: Peter Lang, 1995. Print.
Liebert, Georges. *Nietzsche and Music*. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 2004. Print.
Martin, Robert K. & George Piggford. *Queer Forster*. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1997. Print.
Moffat, Wendy. *E. M. Forster: A New Life*. London: Bloomsbury, 2010. Print.
Nietzsche, Friedrich. *The Birth of Tragedy*. New York: Dover, 1995. Print.
Okuyama, Izumi. *E. M. Forster's Version of "The Unfinished Ninth Symphony": His Use of Effective Sounds and Suggestions in "A Passage to India*." Unpublished master's thesis, 2001. Print.
Parr, Anthony. *Forster, E(dward) M(organ) Opera Bibliography*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2004. Grove Music Online. Print.
Stallybrass, Oliver, ed. *Aspects of E. M. Forster: Essays and Recollections Written for His Ninetieth Birthday*. New York: Harcourt Brace. 1969. Print.
Stone, Wilfred. *The Cave and the Mountain: A Study of E. M. Forster*. Stanford: Stanford UP, 1967. Print.